

Committee Report on Mechanical works at Seven Fields

Date: Jan 7th, 2025

To: Finance & General Purposes Committee

From: Andrew Briggs – Ops Manager

Subject: Evaluation of proposals for Mechanical Works to Seven Fields changing rooms

Council Priority: To provide a high standard of services & facilities

1. Purpose

This report presents the findings from the procurement process for the replacement of mechanical services at Penhill Changing Rooms. The evaluation process included cost and quality assessments for eight contractors. Based on the evaluation, **Contractor C** achieved the highest total weighted score and is recommended for appointment.

2. Background

The Penhill Changing Rooms require upgrades to their mechanical systems, including new water heating systems, showers, blending valves, associated pipework and electrical work.

The project is supported by a Football Foundation grant covering 56% of the project cost (up to £25,000), with the remaining costs financed through a council loan.

An RFQ was issued, and bids were evaluated using a 60% cost / 40% quality split to ensure value for money while maintaining high standards of quality.

3. Evaluation Process

All contractors were assessed using two main criteria:

- **Cost (60%):** Each contractor's price was scored proportionally against the lowest bid.
- **Quality (40%):** Each contractor was evaluated on:
 - Experience & Track Record (15%)
 - Technical Proposal & Methodology (10%)
 - Health & Safety Standards (10%)
 - Environmental & Sustainability Considerations (5%)

The total weighted score determined the ranking of contractors.

4. Evaluation Results

The following table summarises the results:

Contractor	Cost (60%)	Experience (15%)	Technical Proposal (10%)	Health & Safety (10%)	Environmental (5%)	Quality (40%)	Total Weighted Score (100%)	Ranking
Contractor A	60.00%	9.00%	6.00%	4.00%	2.00%	21.00%	81.00%	3
Contractor B	57.80%	9.00%	8.00%	8.00%	3.00%	28.00%	85.80%	2
Contractor C	56.67%	15.00%	10.00%	10.00%	4.00%	39.00%	95.67%	1
Contractor D	20.78%	15.00%	10.00%	10.00%	4.00%	39.00%	59.78%	4
Contractor E	21.42%	12.00%	8.00%	8.00%	3.00%	31.00%	55.42%	5
Contractor F	17.19%	12.00%	10.00%	10.00%	5.00%	37.00%	54.19%	6
Contractor G	2.72%	15.00%	10.00%	10.00%	5.00%	40.00%	42.72%	7
Contractor H	17.44%	15.00%	10.00%	10.00%	5.00%	40.00%	22.56%	8

5. Key Points

1. Cost Efficiency:

- Contractor A submitted the lowest bid, achieving the full cost score of **60%**.
- Contractor C provided a competitive bid, scoring **56.67%** on cost.

2. Quality Excellence:

- Contractor C achieved just short of the maximum quality score at **39.00%**, reflecting strong experience, a robust technical proposal, excellent health and safety compliance, and sustainability practices.
- Contractors D, G, and H also scored highly on quality, but their higher costs reduced their overall competitiveness.

3. Overall Recommendation:

- Contractor C achieved the highest total weighted score of **95.67%**, demonstrating the best combination of cost and quality.

6. Recommendation

It is recommended that the Finance and General Purposes Committee:

1. Recommend the the appointment of **Contractor C** for the replacement of mechanical services at Penhill Changing Rooms to the Jan 2025 Full Council Committee.
2. Authorise the issuance of a Letter of Acceptance to Contractor C to formalise the contract.
3. Ensure that Contractor C adheres to the project timeline to meet the funding deadline set by the Football Foundation.